

**MINI-SYMPOSIUM: NSA BULK METADATA COLLECTION—EVALUATING PRIVACY THROUGH  
THE LENS OF CONTEXTUAL INTEGRITY**

Metadata in Context –An Ontological and Normative Analysis of the NSA’s Bulk Telephony  
Metadata Collection Program

*Paula Kift & Helen Nissenbaum*

On the Wisdom of Categorical (Privacy) Rules

*Kiel Brennan-Marquez*

Putting Data Benefits in Context: A Response to Kift and Nissenbaum

*Gabe Maldoff & Omer Tene*

**ARTICLES**

Privacy Policy and Contextual Harm

*Mark MacCarthy*

How Two Traditions of Privacy Defenses in Image Capture Technology Inform the Debate  
over Drones

*Patrick S. Roberts & Derek Larson*

**BOOK REVIEW**

Connecting Alaskans: A Book Review and Commentary on Universal Service in the  
Broadband Age

*Shannon M. Heim & Erik B. Levy*

**STUDENT NOTE**

Challenging State Sales Tax Statutes on Electronic Commerce Under the Dormant  
Commerce Clause

*Lucas J. Opperman*

# **I/S: A JOURNAL OF LAW AND POLICY FOR THE INFORMATION SOCIETY**

---

**VOLUME 13 NUMBER 2 SPRING 2017**

---

## **FOUNDING GENERAL EDITOR**

Peter M. Shane  
Jacob E. Davis and Jacob E. Davis II Chair in Law  
Moritz College of Law  
The Ohio State University

## **CO-FOUNDING EDITOR EMERITUS**

Peter P. Swire  
Nancy J. and Lawrence P. Huang Professor  
Georgia Institute of Technology College of Business

## **PRIVACY EDITOR**

Dennis D. Hirsch  
Professor of Law and Faculty Director, Program on Data and Governance,  
Moritz College of Law, and Professor of Law, Capital University Law School

**2016–17**

## **STUDENT EDITORIAL BOARD**

### **EDITOR-IN-CHIEF**

Matthew Diaz

### **EXECUTIVE EDITOR**

Lucas Opperman

### **FORMAT EDITOR**

Daniel Bowen

### **SYMPOSIUM EDITOR**

Sara Coulter

Patrick Abell  
Martina Ellerbe

Devona Adjei-Baafuor

Anthony Alfano  
Kiera Finelli  
Ben Fogle  
Chloe Goodlive  
Eugenia Han

### **CHIEF MANAGING EDITOR**

Matthew Emch

### **MANAGING EDITORS**

Jay Patel  
Kelsi Ratcliff

Benjamin Hemmelgarn

Sally Heuker  
Elizabeth Hodder  
Andrew Hopkins  
Javier Lopez

### **TECHNOLOGY EDITOR**

Kristen Basista

### **BUSINESS EDITOR**

Molly Porter

Julie Sanders  
Jimmy Staley

Amber Lucci  
Courtland Perry  
Alicia Rector  
Michael Saldana  
Paige Schaffer  
Brigid Sharek

## INTERNATIONAL EDITORIAL BOARD

Allesandro Acquisti  
Carnegie Mellon University

Patricia Bellia  
University of Notre Dame

L. Jean Camp  
Indiana University

Ryan Calo  
University of Washington

Adam Candeb  
Michigan State University

Mike Carroll  
American University

Jon Caulkins  
Carnegie Mellon University

Bryan Choi  
The Ohio State University

Julie Cohen  
Georgetown University

Jennifer Evans-Cowley  
The Ohio State University

Lorrie Cranor  
Carnegie Mellon University

Brett Frischmann  
Cardozo Law School

Michael Froomkin  
University of Miami

Ron Gdovic  
University of Phoenix

Michael Geist  
University of Ottawa

Ellen Goodman  
Rutgers University

Rob Heverly  
Albany Law School

Stephanie Hoffer  
The Ohio State University

Reed Hundt  
Coalition for Green Capital

Michael Johnson  
University of Massachusetts-  
Boston

Margot Kaminski  
The Ohio State University

Jay Kesan  
University of Illinois

David Landsbergen  
The Ohio State University

David Lazer  
Northeastern University

David Lee  
The Ohio State University

Edward Lee  
Chicago-Kent School of Law

Harry Litman  
Phillips and Cohen LLP

Jessica Litman  
University of Michigan

Peter Madsen  
Carnegie Mellon University

Edward Malecki  
The Ohio State University

Viktor Mayer-Schöenberger  
Oxford Internet Institute

Lisa Nelson  
University of Pittsburgh

Beth Noveck  
New York Law School

Maureen O'Rourke  
Boston University

Elizabeth Rindskopf Parker  
McGeorge University

Jon Peha  
Carnegie Mellon University

Rajiv Ramnath  
The Ohio State University

Joel Reidenberg  
Fordham University

Dakota Rudesill  
The Ohio State University

Norman Sadeh-Kaniecpol  
Carnegie Mellon University

Nathan A. Sales  
George Mason University

Anilkumar Samtani  
Nanyang Business School

Pamela Samuelson  
University of California at  
Berkeley

Ric Simmons  
The Ohio State University

Marvin Sirbu  
Carnegie Mellon University

James Speta  
Northwestern University

Daniel Z. Sui  
The Ohio State University

Rahul Telang  
Carnegie Mellon University

Jonathan Weinberg  
Wayne State University

Kevin Werbach  
University of Pennsylvania

Jane Winn  
University of Washington

Peter A. Winn  
University of Washington

Alfred Yen  
Boston University

Mark D. Young  
Ronin Analytics

**I/S: A JOURNAL OF LAW AND POLICY FOR THE INFORMATION SOCIETY** is an interdisciplinary journal of research and commentary concentrating on the intersection of law, policy, and information technology. **I/S** was founded in 2004 as a one-of-a-kind partnership between one of America’s leading law schools, The Ohio State University Moritz College of Law, and the nation’s foremost public policy school focused on information technology, Carnegie Mellon University’s Heinz College.

**CITATION:** Please cite to 13 *I/S: J.L. & POL’Y FOR INFO. SOC’Y* 333-550 (2017).

**WEBSITE:** Please visit <http://moritzlaw.osu.edu/students/groups/is/> to:

1. Subscribe online
2. Access PDF versions of each Volume and individual articles
3. Review the latest news headlines on relevant **I/S** topics
4. Send questions and comments to **I/S**

**EDITORIAL AND GENERAL OFFICES:** Located at 55 West 12th Avenue, Columbus, Ohio 43210-1391. All **I/S** questions and comments should be submitted via the **I/S** website or can be directed to:

**CONTACT: I/S JOURNAL**  
 The Moritz College of Law  
 55 West 12th Avenue  
 Columbus, OH 43210

**PRICING:**

	STUDENT (W/ ID)	DOMESTIC	FOREIGN	INSTITUTIONAL	SUPPORTING
<b>ANNUAL SUBSCRIPTION</b>	\$25.00	\$45.00	\$100.00	\$100.00	\$150.00

**SUBSCRIPTIONS:** To subscribe or purchase single issues/articles online please visit the **I/S** website. To subscribe via the mail, please enclose check made payable to “**I/S JOURNAL**” and send to **I/S**. **I/S** will assume that each subscriber desires to renew its subscription unless the subscriber notifies **I/S** otherwise before the subscription expires. Back stock, reprint, and microform editions of **I/S** are available upon request via the **I/S** website or upon written request to **I/S**.

**ACCOUNT INFORMATION:** **I/S** requires receipt of notification of any changes to account information (i.e., address change) at least thirty days prior to date of the next issue with which that change is to take effect. In order to help facilitate an immediate update of account information, please visit the **I/S** website ([moritzlaw.osu.edu/students/groups/is/](http://moritzlaw.osu.edu/students/groups/is/)) or send a written notification to **I/S**.

**SUBMISSIONS:** **I/S** is devoted to publishing outstanding research and writing that addresses the legal and policy aspects of e-government and e-democracy, cybersecurity, online privacy and public information policy, e-commerce, information technology and economic development, telecommunications regulation, or any other aspect of the social, economic, political, or cultural implications of information technology. We welcome submissions from all relevant disciplines, including law and business, engineering and science, the social sciences, and the humanities—so long as the manuscript addresses its topic in its legal or policy aspects.

Volumes 1-10 of **I/S** comprise three issues per volume. **I/S** now publishes two issues per volume, beginning with Volume 11. One issue is devoted to papers presented at the previous year’s annual **I/S** symposium, focusing on a major issue or theme at the intersection of law, policy, and new information, communication and computing technologies. The other issue includes the very best of the unsolicited manuscripts we receive on subjects within the **I/S** subject matter domain.

**I/S** welcomes unsolicited manuscripts in four categories: full-length research articles (typically around 10,000 words); shorter, less formal commentaries that address cutting-edge policy topics related to information and communication technology (“ICT”) and society (typically no more than 5000 words), student research, and book reviews.

Because our examination of unsolicited manuscripts entails a combination of student and professional review, it is helpful if manuscripts proposed for publication in any given academic year reach us by June 1 of the preceding academic year. Inquiries concerning format, topic, or anything else may be forwarded to **I/S** at any time.

**COPYRIGHT INFORMATION:** Copyright © 2017 by **I/S: A JOURNAL OF LAW AND POLICY FOR THE INFORMATION SOCIETY**. Please direct copyright inquiries to Editorial and General Offices address listed above.  
**ISSN:** 2372-2969 (PRINT), 2372-2967 (ONLINE)

