

Supplemental Online Materials for

**Policy in Theory and Policy in Practice: Community College Students' Perceptions of**

**Cross-Enrollment**

## **Methods**

### **Recruitment**

Purposeful sampling is the act of strategically recruiting and selecting participants whose experiences or perspectives are relevant to the research questions (Creswell & Poth, 2018). Our campus partners believed that there would be a significant number of students who signed up for but did not attend focus groups, so we allowed 20 students to sign up for each focus group, expecting that only half would attend. However, we had less attrition than we expected and our first focus groups, which were scheduled at Mountain College and Beach View College, were larger than we intended. Thus, we capped subsequent sign-ups at 10 students with the expectation that there would be little attrition. Because our focus groups at Sunshine College were later in the semester, after we had adjusted our recruitment, our focus groups at this college were significantly smaller. Although Sunshine College has smaller groups, it is in the same college district as Mountain College which is important because the same policies may apply on each campus.

### **Data Collection**

Only the first two focus groups, when we were calibrating student attrition rates, were larger than 12 students. After we realized that attrition rates were lower than we expected, we had two sets of note-takers and facilitators present for each scheduled focus group so that we could split into two smaller groups if necessary. In all focus groups, moderators used strategies to encourage participation from all participants. Specifically, moderators consciously made eye contact, used participants' names, vocalized the order in which they would call on students, prompted active listeners to chime in if they noticed non-verbal reactions, used positive redirection, restated their understanding of what informants shared, and maintained an upbeat

tone while standing and moving throughout the semi-circle seating layout as informants shared. These strategies were especially important in the larger focus groups.

### **Analyses**

In phase II of our data analysis, we undergo a double coding process, as described in the main text. This double coding process is further described here. Each researcher coded two transcripts on Atlas.ti, saving two versions of each transcript. The first version included the selected units of analysis with assigned codes attached; the second version removed the assigned codes, leaving only the selected units of analysis visible to the second coder (Campbell et al., 2013). For each transcript, the second coder used the version without the assigned codes in order to assign his/her own codes to the prior coder's selected quotes/units of analysis. In the second round, the second coder also selected additional units of analysis and attached codes as they saw necessary (Campbell et al., 2013). Each pair of coders then met to review both of their coded transcripts and discuss agreements or disagreements on assigned codes (Richards & Hemphill, 2018). Each pair of coders met and made note of their thought process, the instances in which they agreed, the instances when they could not agree, and a short description of instances of disagreement. Next, the full coding team met and built upon the double coding process by discussing the one-on-one inter-coder agreements and disagreements. In cases in which the coding pairs could not agree, the full team discussed and came to a group-based consensus on the appropriate unitization and code.

**Supplemental Table 1**  
*Cross-Enrollment Code Descriptions*

	<b>Cross-Enrollment Code</b>	<b>Description</b>
1	Ability to Succeed	Captures considerations of course difficulty, course load, pace of course, stigmas around program/course
2	Class Size	Consideration for number of students in a four-year university course
3	Course Availability	Whether courses that are needed are available to students; Considerations of time conflicts due to various responsibilities.
4	Course or Institution Quality	Considerations of courses or the reputation of the institution as a whole being of a certain quality or not
5	Distance	Considerations of the distance of a campus from home or from current CCC
6	Familiarity with Campus	The idea that familiarity with the campus, both prior and future, plays a role (positively, negatively, or neutral) in enrolling in CE courses.
7	Financial	Perception that a program/service will save money or that it will cost more and be difficult to pay.
8	Interest	Students showing interest in learning more about cross-enrollment regardless of whether they previously knew about it or whether they mentioned actually wanting to pursue it.
9	Knowledge of CE	Has or doesn't have knowledge of CE. If so, information sources should also be linked.
10	Networking	Considerations for the potential to establish relationships/networks on university campuses that they may transfer to as a factor in CE.
11	Parking	Captures cost of parking, having to spend extra time looking for parking, etc. but is not intended to capture distance as this is a separate code.
12	Perceived Support from CC	How students perceive their current CC institution stands on cross-enrollment.
13	Professor Availability	Consideration of faculty availability at four-year universities.
14	Resources	Consideration of what resources (e.g., disability services, writing center, tutoring, clubs/organizations, library access, etc.) are available at four-year universities that students would consider cross-enrolling in.
15	Transfer Application & UC Credits	Perception that enrolling in CE courses will either strengthen or harm one's application for transfer.
16	Other	Catch-all for other CE factors not specified

Note. Concept building lifted quotes associated with these sub-codes from the cross-enrollment code group from the data and re-organized them as part of the pattern finding process.

**Supplemental Table 2***Qualifier Code Descriptions*

	<b>Qualifier Code</b>	<b>Description</b>
1	Barrier	Barriers specify structural constraints
2	Unhelpful	Perception that an experience with a program/service/staff member did not help the student
3	Inaccessible	Student access to service/staff member is NOT readily accessible
4	Inaccurate	An experience where incorrect or out of date information was provided to a student by some means
5	Incentive	Specifies beneficial factors that encourage or incentivize students to take up certain opportunities (e.g., cross-enrollment) in their academic journey.
6	Helpful	An experience or interaction that is generally described as being positive or conducive to a students' efforts
7	Readily Accessible	Student access to service and/or staff member is readily accessible
8	Recommendation	A recommendation that a student defines for addressing barriers to cross-enrollment and/or transfer. Can be programmatic or state policy level (micro – macro levels)

Note. Concept building lifted quotes associated with these sub-codes from the cross-enrollment code group from the data and re-organized them as part of the pattern finding process.

**Supplemental Table 3***Overall List Summarizing Student Recommendations: Implications for Practice and Policy*

#	Recommendation
1	Designate a focal point of contact at each campus who is in charge of being thoroughly informed on cross-enrollment details.
2	Create a website with step-by-step instructions on cross-enrollment that is applicable across institutions.
3	Implement only one course registration portal across all CA public higher education systems.
4	Make financial aid awards valid across any CA public higher education institution.
5	Assign students one student I.D. that is applicable across the CA public higher education system.
6	Hold both four-year and CC administrations accountable for the promotion of and ease of access to CE and other similar opportunities.
7	Encourage counselors and administrators to adopt positive reinforcement and positive rephrasing techniques during their student interactions.

Note. Positive reinforcement and rephrasing encourage the use of positive wording in place of words with negative connotations (e.g., no, can't, don't, won't). This technique aims to cultivate a more proactive and productive dialogue.

### **Focus Group Protocol**

*\*Please arrive at least 15-minutes prior to scheduled start time to set-up the room in a u-shaped layout, put up large sticky notes on a clean wall (if no white board available), set-up the food, set-up iPad with demographic questionnaire as backup etc.*

### **Focus Group Outcomes**

**Outcome 1:** Gain an understanding of student experiences with the transfer pathways available at their institution, which includes perceived barriers and benefits to cross-enrollment.

**Outcome 2:** Learn how to improve the 2- to 4-year gap (in STEM fields specifically) via cross-enrollment through identifying student needs.

**Approximate total time:** 60-90 minutes

### **Focus Group Outline**

1. Welcome and food
2. Meeting overview/study information review
  - a. Read it out loud and have copies available for participants who would like to follow along
3. Demographics Questionnaire & Consent
  - a. provide link to participants: \_\_\_\_\_
4. Participant introductions
  - a. Name
  - b. Least favorite Halloween candy or least favorite thanksgiving dish?
5. Discussion/Questions
6. Thanks
  - a. Remind them to fill out the demographics questionnaire and check the spelling of their emails so that everyone receives their Amazon gift card

### **Focus Group Information**

Date:

Time:

Location:

Number of Participants:

Lead:

Note Taker:

Space for facilitators general notes:

**Focus Group Script**  
**Pre-Discussion Questions**

*\*as people walk-in please welcome them and invite them to enjoy the food.*

**Introduction:** Good afternoon/morning and welcome. Thank you for taking the time to talk to us today. My name is \_\_\_\_\_ and I work with \_\_\_\_\_.

**Explain purpose of focus group:** \_\_\_\_\_ is working with local California Community Colleges, one of which is [Name of CCC], to better understand how they can best serve their students interested in transferring, in particular into a STEM field. You were invited here today to talk about your experiences with the transfer process to a 4-year university and your experiences or knowledge of cross-enrollment opportunities. We look forward to hearing what you have to share.

**Duration:** We expect this conversation to last about one hour and possibly up to an hour and a half. We do ask that at the end of this forum you complete a short demographics questionnaire if you have not done so already. We will send you a link to the demographic questionnaire and once that's complete, we will also send you a \$30 Amazon gift-card to thank you for your time.

**Describe facilitator role:** I will be leading this discussion and my job is to ask all of you a series of questions that will help us learn what is most important to you and your peers. I will do my best to ensure that the group stays on track. Assisting me is \_\_\_\_\_.

**Describe notetaker role:** \_\_\_\_\_ will be taking notes to make sure we capture the conversation and information you provide to us. Please note that our note taker is not going to write down who said what. Instead, they will be capturing the overall discussion.

**Confidentiality/Verbal Consent:** During this session, participation is completely voluntary. You do not have to participate if you do not want to. This group conversation will NOT be video recorded. However, we would like your consent to audio record today's session. With your consent we will transcribe the audio recordings in an effort to accurately capture and interpret your experiences. Your name will not be connected with any of your comments or included in any reports about this forum. All of our reports will be written about comments from the group overall. Everything you tell us is private. We can't guarantee confidentiality, however, we are collectively responsible to make sure anything discussed in today's forum stay amongst the participants.

**Describe participants role:** Before we begin, we want to emphasize that we truly value all ideas and will do our best to make sure that everyone has an equal chance to participate and that we create a respectful environment for everyone. There is no right or wrong answer to the questions we ask. There may be different points of view, but all responses are important. Please feel free to share your point of view even if it is different from what others have said. We want to hear from all of you.

**Time for Questions:** Does anyone have any questions before we begin? If there are no other questions, let's get started.



*\*Note for facilitator: while there is a large pool of questions please be aware that it is important to follow the lead of the participants and be able to adjust to the various types of groups you may have (e.g., by shifting the order of the questions, knowing when to skip questions that have already been answered as a result of the flow of the conversation, rewording questions in a clear manner when needed, probing and following up on key statements and comments). It is OK to not get through the entire list, we want this to be a positive experience for everyone.*

### **Group 3: Transfer Intending Students Who Have Never Cross-Enrolled**

#### **Focus Group Discussion Questions**

*\*Please make sure to check mark which questions were covered vs. those that were not. The notetaker should be capturing this as well but just to make sure.*

**Opening:** Welcome everyone, I'd like to start with short introductions. We will go around the room and invite everyone to share their name and how long they've been at this community college.

Factor	Questions <i>*sub-points are prompts to help facilitate the conversation in meaningful ways</i>
Transfer Goals & Knowledge	1. What are some of your end goals and how has attending this community college played a role in those goals? a. Do you intend to transfer? i. If yes: 1. When do you intend to transfer and why then? 2. Where would you consider transferring to and why?
	2. Where do students from this school tend to transfer to and why? a. Do students usually go to local 4-years schools like [local CSU and UC examples] – or – do they usually go further away? i. For those who stay in CA, do students tend to transfer to CSU's or UC's?
	3. How have you received information about the transfer process – if any? a. What are the resources or services that are accessible to students who wish to transfer? What are some online resources that you've referred to for assistance in navigating the transfer process? b. Are there any resources or services that are specific to students who want to transfer to a STEM degree? If so, how did you learn of these? i. What are some of your experiences with the Academic Counselors or Transfer and Admissions offices at <b>this</b> institution? ii. What are some of your experiences with the Academic Counselors or Transfer and Admissions offices at <b>4-year Universities</b> ?
	4. In your opinion what are the most urgent problems or largest barriers for students who intend to transfer from this college? (e.g., financial, familial responsibilities, lack of accurate clear information, distance)
Cross-Enrollment Knowledge, Experiences,	5. Have you ever heard of cross-enrollment? ( <i>taking courses at a 4-year school while enrolled full-time at the community college level and paying the same amount of tuition</i> ) a. If yes: i. Briefly, how would you define cross-enrollment? ii. How did you learn what you know now about cross-enrollment?
	6. Have you ever taken a class at a 4-year institution? At another community college? <i>This can include classes taken during the school year or in the Summers or as part of a scholarship or research program.</i>

and Perceived Benefits	<p>a. If so, can you share what that experience consisted of for you? (e.g., when and where, how did you decide which class to take, did you get credit for it that counts toward a degree at any school?)</p> <p>b. If not, have you ever been interested but have yet to do so? What kinds of classes would you be interested in taking at a four-year school or another CC while enrolled at your main community college campus?</p> <p>i. What makes you interested in taking certain types of classes? (e.g., to meet general ed requirements, to meet an upper division course in your major, cool elective, want to get a feel for a 4-year campus)</p> <p>7. If you were to take classes at a 4-year school while enrolled at the community college, how would you go about doing that?</p> <p>a. How would you decide which class to take, when to take it, and where to take it?</p> <p>b. Where would you go to find information about cross-enrollment?</p> <p>8. If you know anyone who has taken classes at a 4-year institution can you share a little about what you know from their experiences or the information they share?</p> <p>a. How did you learn that they were taking classes at a 4-year? (e.g., advisor or faculty connected you to them, came up casually in conversation, mutual friends)</p> <p>9. What sort of factors would contribute to your decision on taking a course at a 4-year university? How about at another CC?</p> <p>a. What kinds of benefits or possibilities do you see in cross-enrollment? What are some reasons one might cross-enroll?</p>
Cross-Enrollment Barriers	<p>10. What are reasons that students might find it difficult to take classes at a four-year college or another CC while enrolled at a two-year school? What are some reasons one might NOT want to cross-enroll?</p> <p>a. In your opinion what are the most urgent problems or largest barriers for students whom want to cross-enroll? (e.g., financial, familial responsibilities, lack of accurate clear information, distance)</p> <p>11. What are some recommendations that you have in order to make cross-enrollment a more streamlined part of the transfer process?</p> <p>a. What kinds of supports/resources would make it easier for you to cross enroll in the future?</p>
Closing	<p>12. Is there anything else that you would like to share with us about your experiences with the transfer process or cross-enrollment?</p>

**Thank all the participants for their time and remind them to provide their email in order to receive the demographic questionnaire and gift card before they leave. Offer the participants to enjoy some food for a bit or take some for the road if there are leftovers.**



*\*make sure to clean up and leave the room exactly as you found it, let the appropriate parties know when the focus group is complete, thank them, and let them know you are heading out.*

**CA Senate Bill 1914 Exact Language**

BILL NUMBER: SB 1914      CHAPTERED    09/12/94  
BILL TEXT  
CHAPTER      552  
FILED WITH SECRETARY OF STATE      SEPTEMBER 12, 1994  
APPROVED BY GOVERNOR      SEPTEMBER 11, 1994

PASSED THE SENATE  
PASSED THE ASSEMBLY  
AMENDED IN ASSEMBLY  
AMENDED IN ASSEMBLY  
AMENDED IN SENATE  
AMENDED IN SENATE  
AMENDED IN SENATE  
AMENDED IN SENATE  
AUGUST 26, 1994  
AUGUST 24, 1994  
AUGUST 8, 1994  
JUNE 29, 1994

MAY 31, 1994  
MAY 10, 1994  
APRIL 27, 1994  
APRIL 12, 1994

INTRODUCED BY    Senators Killea, Dills, and Hughes  
FEBRUARY 25, 1994

An act to add and repeal Chapter 9.5 (commencing with Section 66750) of Part 40 of the Education Code, relating to postsecondary education.

LEGISLATIVE COUNSEL'S DIGEST

SB 1914, Killea. Postsecondary education: cross-enrollment. Existing law requires the Board of Governors of the California Community Colleges, the Regents of the University of California, and the Trustees of the California State University to develop, maintain, and disseminate a common core curriculum in general education courses for the purposes of transfer. Under existing law, any person who has successfully completed the transfer core curriculum shall be deemed to have completed all lower division general education requirements for the University of California and the California State University. This bill would permit any student who meets specified criteria and who is enrolled in any campus of the

California Community Colleges, the California State University, or the University of California to enroll without formal admission or payment of additional fees, except an administration fee of not more than \$10, in a maximum of one course per academic term at a campus of either of the other systems on a space available basis at the discretion of the appropriate campus authorities on both campuses, as specified. These provisions would become operative commencing with the fall 1995 term and would be repealed on January 1, 2000.

The bill would require the California Community Colleges, the California State University, and the University of California

to evaluate the impact of the program established by this bill and to report to the California Postsecondary Education Commission on or before June 30, 1998, on specified matters to determine whether the program should be established permanently.

The bill would require the California Postsecondary Education Commission to prepare a report based on the information from the segments and present the report, with recommendations, to the Governor and the Legislature on or before December 1, 1998.

Under existing law, these provisions would not apply to the University of California except to the extent that the Regents of the University of California, by appropriate resolution, make them applicable.

THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA DO ENACT AS FOLLOWS:

SECTION 1. The Legislature finds and declares all of the following:

(a) Public postsecondary educational institutions would become more learner-centered than institution-centered by providing an opportunity for students of the California Community Colleges, the California State University, and the University of California to cross-enroll without formal admission or payment of additional fees in a maximum of one course per academic term at a campus of either of the other systems. This policy would enable campuses of those institutions to become more accessible, become more responsive to student needs, to make cross-enrollment procedures simpler and less time consuming, and to begin to develop a new model of a college or university for the 21st century.

(b) Facilitating cross-enrollment of students responds to subdivision (c) of Section 66738 of the Education Code, which states, in part, that the "governing board of each segment shall expand existing practices related to concurrent enrollment, in which community college students are provided the opportunity to take courses at University of California and California State University campuses, as space is available; and to expand opportunities for potential transfer students to participate in activities that familiarize them with the university campus."

(c) California is struggling to provide adequate educational opportunities for California residents while reeling from the impact of diminished budgets and calls for reduced costs. Expediting greater cross-enrollment of students of the California Community Colleges, the California State University, and the University of California would respond to legislative and postsecondary institutional interest in sharing resources, increasing ease of access, and encouraging intersegmental cooperation.

(d) Using technological advances will free students who wish to cross-enroll from the following steps:

- (1) Completion of an admission application.
- (2) Payment of an admission application fee.
- (3) Submission of transcripts from the home institution to the host campus.

(e) The Legislature remains interested in the segments of public postsecondary education developing, in consultation with independent institutions, intrasegmental, intersegmental, and regional specialization agreements for specified areas of education. Public segments are encouraged to develop new programs and to project and identify societal and educational needs as well as innovative educational programs. This act to facilitate cross-enrollment represents but one program designed to respond to these goals.

(f) Enactment of this act is a major step toward achieving a seamless transition of students between the higher education systems. "Step-to-college" programs already exist to encourage high school students to enroll concurrently in courses offered at local colleges and universities. This proposal would afford a similar opportunity to community college students.

(g) Increased access to the California Community Colleges, the California State University, and the University of

California by an uncomplicated cross-enrollment option responds directly to Master Plan Review recommendations to "develop new programs of outreach, recruitment, and cooperation" between the segments.

(h) California Community College students who enroll concurrently would be lower division students, most likely wishing to sample university courses. The experience would provide an opportunity to bolster the confidence of California Community College students by their successful performance in university level courses, thereby encouraging them to continue their education beyond the associate degree level. Accordingly, cross-enrollment has the potential to increase transfers from the California Community Colleges to the California State University and the University of California, including the transfer of students from underrepresented groups.

(i) Enactment of this act will also provide California State University and University of California students with the opportunity to take lower division courses at the California Community Colleges without additional cost. Students may find it necessary to look to the California Community Colleges for courses not offered by the California State University and the University of California campuses or not available during a given term.

(j) Since only qualified students would be permitted to enroll at a campus of the other system on a space available basis and since students would no longer require admission and legislatively mandated matriculation services, additional workload from cross-enrollment at campuses of the California Community Colleges, the California State University, and the University of California should be minimized.

SEC. 2. Chapter 9.5 (commencing with Section 66750) is added to Part 40 of the Education Code, to read:

#### CHAPTER 9.5. CROSS-ENROLLMENT

66750. For purposes of this chapter, the following definitions apply:

(a) "Home campus" means the campus at which the student is matriculated.

(b) "Host campus" means the campus to which the student seeks access.

66751. Any student enrolled in any campus of the California Community Colleges, the California State University, or the University of California who meets the requirements of

Section 66752 may enroll without formal admission and, except as provided in Section 66753, payment of additional fees, in a maximum of one course per academic term at a campus of either of the other systems on a space available basis at the discretion of the appropriate campus authorities on both campuses. A student enrolled in a course pursuant to this chapter shall be provided access to necessary instructional support services at the host campus in the same manner as students regularly enrolled in the course.

66752. A student is qualified to participate in the program established by this chapter if he or she is enrolled in any campus of the California Community Colleges, the California State University, or the University of California and meets the following requirements:

(a) The student has completed at least one term at the home campus as a matriculated student and is taking at least six units at the home campus during the current term.

(b) The student has attained a grade point average of 2.0 (grade of C) for work completed.

(c) The student has paid appropriate tuition or fees, or both, required by the home campus for the academic term in which the student seeks to cross-enroll.

(d) The student has the appropriate academic preparation, as determined by the host campus, consistent with the standard applied to currently enrolled students, to enroll in the course in which the student seeks to enroll.

66752.5. Courses that are not state-supported, including extension and summer session courses, are not subject to this chapter.

66753. (a) The Chancellor of the California Community Colleges, the Chancellor of the California State University, and the President of the University of California shall establish procedures so that a student meeting the requirements of Section 66752 may be certified by the home campus as to eligibility, residence, fee, financial aid, and health status.

The host campus may require the applicant to submit additional information as needed. The host campus may charge participating students an administration fee, not to exceed ten dollars (\$10) per academic term.

(b) A student enrolled pursuant to this chapter shall be exempt from participation in the matriculation services

described in Article 1 (commencing with Section 78210) of Chapter 2 of Part 48.

66753.5. The enrollment of a student at a host campus pursuant to this chapter shall not be counted in the calculation of headcount or full-time equivalent student enrollment at either the home campus or the host campus.

66754. This chapter shall become operative commencing with the fall 1995 term.

66755. (a) The California Community Colleges, the California State University, and the University of California shall evaluate the impact of the program established by this chapter and shall report to the California Postsecondary Education Commission on or before June 30, 1998, on student use, revenue implications, and other issues that may be identified to judge satisfactorily the program's efficiency and determine whether it should be established permanently.

(b) The California Postsecondary Education Commission shall prepare a report based on the information from the segments and, notwithstanding Section 7550.5 of the Government Code, shall present the report, with recommendations, to the Governor and the Legislature on or before December 1, 1998.

66756. This chapter shall remain in effect only until January 1, 2000, and as of that date is repealed, unless a later enacted statute, which is enacted before January 1, 2000, deletes or extends that date.