

# OHIO STATE LAW JOURNAL

Volume 73, Number 4, 2012

## Articles

- Reviewing Congressionally Created Remedies for Excessiveness  
*Colleen P. Murphy* ..... 651
- Justice and Beneficence in Military Medicine and Research  
*Efthimios Parasidis* ..... 723
- Broadband Localism  
*Olivier Sylvain* ..... 795

## Note

- The Road to Better Redistricting: Empirical Analysis and State-Based  
Reforms to Counter Partisan Gerrymandering  
*Noah Litton* ..... 839





Cite as 73 OHIO ST. L.J. \_\_\_\_ (2012)

Copyright © 2012 by The Ohio State University

The *Ohio State Law Journal* (ISSN 0048-1572) is published six times a year in Columbus, Ohio. The *Journal* Editorial and General Offices are located at 55 West 12th Avenue, Columbus, Ohio 43210-1391.

Subscriptions: Domestic, \$45.00 per volume; \$9.00 per regular issue; \$10.00 per symposium issue. Foreign, \$55.00 per volume; \$10.00 per regular issue; \$11.00 per symposium issue. Please enclose check with order. For further information or to pay by credit card, see <http://moritzlaw.osu.edu/lawjournal>. Back stock, reprint, and microform editions of the *Journal* are available through William S. Hein & Co., Inc., 1285 Main St., Buffalo, N.Y. 14209-1987. Back issues of the *Journal* may also be obtained through HeinOnline at <http://www.heinonline.org>.

The *Journal* assumes that each subscriber desires to renew its subscription unless the subscriber notifies the *Journal* otherwise before the subscription expires. Change of address notice should be received at least thirty days prior to the date of the issue with which that change is to take effect.

The *Journal* welcomes the submission of unsolicited manuscripts for possible publication. The text and footnotes of all manuscripts should be double spaced, with the text and footnotes on the same page. Manuscripts will not be returned, however, unless accompanied with return postage. The *Journal* will accept submissions by email attachment. You may submit manuscripts and correspond with the *Journal* at [lawjml@osu.edu](mailto:lawjml@osu.edu). For further information, see <http://moritzlaw.osu.edu/students/groups/oslj/>.

Postmaster: Please send address changes to the *Ohio State Law Journal*, 55 West 12th Avenue, Columbus, Ohio 43210-1391.

# OHIO STATE LAW JOURNAL

---

---

2012–2013

---

---

## EDITOR IN CHIEF

Barbara J. Jordan

## EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Courter Shimeall

## SYMPOSIUM EDITOR

Thomas Vetter

## CHIEF ARTICLES EDITOR

Ann Yackshaw

## NOTE EDITOR

Christopher Meltzer

## FURTHERMORE EDITOR

Susan Manship

## ARTICLES EDITORS

Ben Davies

Ranya Elzein

JT Larson

Christopher Luken

Christina Marino

Jonathan Misny

Trent Moyer

Todd Seaman

Kevin Snell

Gretchen Walsh

Meredith Willsen

Shawna Yoffe

## TECHNOLOGY EDITOR

Andrew J. Keller

## BUSINESS EDITOR

Janay Stevens

## CHIEF MANAGING EDITOR

Christina Karam

## EVENTS EDITOR

Daniel Best

## MANAGING EDITORS

T. Conrad Bower

Alyssa J. Bowerman

Nicole Chatham

Andrew M. Gammill

Joe Greiner

Marleen Kindel

Noah Litton

Maggie Muething

Caitlin Murphy

Travis Owsley

Alex Pierce

Kara Singleton

Elizabeth Wiseman

Sean Wright

## ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Holly Coats

Brandon Frank

Andrea K. Green

Tiffany Lacore

Nitya Lohitsa

Lauren May

Chase Thompson

## STAFF

Matt Borden

Matthew Brady

Whitney Braunlin

Abbigail Brothers

Cheyenne N. Chambers

Alexis Cole

Casey Cross

Michael Dallaire

Jourdan Day

Ryan Duerring

Meaghan K. FitzGerald

Amanda Gillen

Elizabeth R. Gorman

Joshua Grossman

Jocelyn Harrington

Andrew Hartman

Lisa M. Herman

Natalie Holzaepfel

Melvis O. Houseman

Elizabeth B. Howard

Colin J. Kalvas

Aaron Kenter

Mariam Keramati

Alyson Letsky

Meghan Mannion

Chris Matgouranis

Scott Mayland

Kelsey Mehaffie

Kristine Missall

Jonathan Olivito

Andrew Peiffer

Christopher Pendleton

Adam Philipp

Syane Roy

Jim Saywell

Brendan J. Schlauch

Kyle Schrodi

Kyle Shelton

Matthew Strayer

Catherine Sturik

David N. Sutton

David J. Twombly

Megan E. Walker

Jana Willsey

## FACULTY ADVISORS

Garry W. Jenkins

Deborah Jones Merritt

## ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT

Dawn Parker

---

---

*Published Six Times a Year by Students of The Ohio State University Moritz College of Law*

---

---

# THE OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY MORITZ COLLEGE OF LAW

## OFFICERS OF ADMINISTRATION

E. Gordon Gee, B.A., J.D., Ed.D., *President of the University and Prof. of Law*  
Joseph A. Alutto, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., *Executive Vice President and Provost of the University*  
Alan C. Michaels, A.B., J.D., *Dean of the College and Edwin M. Cooperman Prof. of Law*  
Gary W. Jenkins, B.A., M.P.P., J.D., *Assoc. Dean for Academic Affairs and Prof. of Law*  
Bruce S. Johnson, B.A., J.D., M.L.S., *Assoc. Dean for Information Services and Thomas J. and Mary E. Heck and Leo H. Faust Memorial Designated Prof. of Law*  
Kathy S. Northern, B.A., J.D., *Assoc. Dean for Admissions and Assoc. Prof. of Law*  
Donald B. Tobin, B.A., J.D., *Assoc. Dean for Faculty and Frank E. & Virginia H. Bazler Designated Prof. in Business Law*  
Jessica Richman Dworkin, B.S., J.D., LL.M., *Assist. Dean for International and Graduate Affairs and Adjunct Prof.*  
Monte Smith, B.A., J.D., *Assist. Dean for Academic Affairs and Adjunct Prof.*  
Robert L. Solomon, II, B.A., J.D., *Assist. Dean for Admissions and Financial Aid, Director of Minority Affairs and Adjunct Prof.*

## FACULTY EMERITI

Francis X. Beytagh, B.A., J.D.  
Michael Braunstein, B.A., J.D.  
Albert L. Clovis, B.A., M.A., LL.B.  
Howard P. Fink, B.A., LL.B.  
David A. Goldberger, B.A., J.D.  
Sheldon W. Halpern, B.A., LL.B.  
Lawrence R. Herman, A.B., LL.B.  
Louis A. Jacobs, A.B., J.D., LL.M.  
Michael Kindred, B.A., J.D., M.C.L., D.E.S.  
Joan M. Krauskopf, A.B., J.D.

Stanley K. Laughlin, Jr., B.A., J.D.  
James E. Meeks, A.B., J.D.  
Rhonda R. Rivera, B.A., M.P.A., J.D.  
Nancy H. Rogers, B.A., J.D.  
Michael D. Rose, B.A., J.D., LL.M.  
Allan J. Samansky, B.A., M.A., J.D.  
Philip C. Sorensen, B.S., J.D.  
Gregory M. Travaglio, B.A., J.D., LL.M.  
Douglas J. Whaley, B.A., J.D.

## FACULTY

Amna Akbar, B.A., J.D., *Visiting Assist. Prof. of Law*  
Michelle Alexander, B.A., J.D., *Assoc. Prof. of Law*  
Erin Archerd, B.A., J.D., *Langdon Fellow in Dispute Resolution*  
Mary Beth Beazley, B.A., J.D., *Assoc. Prof. of Law and Director of Legal Writing*  
Douglas A. Berman, A.B., J.D., *Robert J. Watkins/Procter & Gamble Prof. of Law*  
Gregory A. Caldeira, B.A., A.M., Ph.D., *Distinguished Univ. Prof. and Prof. of Law*  
Cinnamon Carlane, B.A., B.C.L., M.S., J.D., *Assoc. Prof. of Law*  
Sanford N. Caust-Ellenbogen, B.A., M.C.R.P., J.D., *Assoc. Prof. of Law*  
Martha Chamallas, B.A., J.D., *Robert D. Lynn Chair in Law*  
Daniel C.K. Chow, B.A., J.D., *Joseph S. Platt-Porter Wright Morris & Arthur Prof. of Law*  
Amy J. Cohen, B.A., J.D., *Assoc. Prof. of Law*  
Sarah Rudolph Cole, B.A., J.D., *John W. Bricker Prof. of Law and Director of Prog. on Dispute Resolution*  
Ruth Colker, A.B., J.D., *Distinguished Univ. Prof. and Grace Fern Heck Faust Chair in Constitutional Law*  
Elizabeth Ilgen Cooke, B.A., J.D., *Clinical Prof. of Law*  
Richard C. Daley, B.A., J.D., *Senior Lecturer in Law*  
Steven M. Davidoff, B.A., M.S., J.D., *Assoc. Prof. of Law*  
Sharon L. Davies, B.A., J.D., *John C. Elam/Vorys Sater Prof. of Law and Executive Director of the William E. Kirwan Institute for the Study of Race and Ethnicity*  
Ellen E. Deason, B.A., J.D., *Joanne W. Murphy/Classes of 1965 and 1972 Prof. of Law*  
Joshua Dressler, B.A., J.D., *Frank R. Strong Chair in Law*  
Terri L. Enns, B.A., J.D., *Clinical Prof. of Law*  
Christopher M. Fairman, B.A., J.D., *Alumni Society Designated Prof. of Law*  
Katherine Hunt Federle, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Prof. of Law and Director of the Center for Interdisciplinary Law and Policy Studies*  
Edward B. Foley, B.A., J.D., *Chief Justice Thomas J. Moyer Professor for the Administration of Justice and the Rule of Law*  
Lary T. Garvin, B.A., B.S., M.S., J.D., *Lawrence D. Stanley Prof. of Law*

Arthur F. Greenbaum, B.A., J.D., *James W. Shocknessy Prof. of Law*  
L. Camille Hébert, B.A., J.D., *Carter C. Kissell Prof. of Law*  
Stephanie R. Hoffer, B.S., J.D., LL.M., *Assoc. Prof. of Law*  
Steven F. Huefner, A.B., J.D., *Prof. of Law and Director of Clinical Prof.*  
Katherine S. Kelly, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Assist. Clinical Prof. of Law*  
Creola Johnson, B.S., J.D., *Prof. of Law*  
Kimberly Jordan, B.S., J.D., *Assist. Clinical Prof. of Law*  
Robert M. Krivoshey, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., J.D., *Clinical Prof. of Law*  
Katrina J. Lee, B.A., J.D., *Assist. Clinical Prof. of Law*  
Deborah Jones Merritt, A.B., J.D., *John Deaver Drinko-Baker and Hostetter Chair in Law*  
Dale A. Oesterle, B.A., M.P.P., J.D., *J. Gilbert Reese Chair in Contract Law*  
John B. Quigley, A.B., M.A., LL.B., *President's Club Prof. of Law*  
Anne Ralph, B.A., J.D., *Assist. Clinical Prof. of Law*  
Guy A. Rub, LL.B., M.A., LL.M., *Assist. Prof. of Law*  
Paul Rose, B.A., J.D., *Assoc. Prof. of Law*  
Peter M. Shane, A.B., J.D., *Jacob E. Davis & Jacob E. Davis II Chair in Law*  
Ric Simmons, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Prof. of Law*  
Marc S. Spindelmann, B.A., J.D., *Isadore and Ida Topper Prof. of Law*  
Todd A. Starker, B.A., M.B.A., J.D., *Assist. Clinical Prof. of Law*  
David Stebenne, B.A., J.D., Ph.D., *Prof. of History and Prof. of Law*  
Joseph B. Stulberg, B.A., J.D., M.A., Ph.D., *Michael E. Moritz Chair in Alternative Dispute Resolution*  
Peter P. Swire, B.A., J.D., *C. William O'Neill Prof. of Law and Judicial Administration*  
C. Lee Thomason, B.A., J.D., *Assist. Clinical Prof. of Law*  
Daniel P. Tokaji, A.B., J.D., *Robert M. Duncan/Jones Day Designated Prof. of Law*  
Vincene F. Verdun, B.A., J.D., *Assoc. Prof. of Law*  
Christopher J. Walker, B.A., M.P.P., J.D., *Assist. Prof. of Law*  
Charles E. Wilson, B.S., J.D., *Assoc. Prof. of Law*

## ADJUNCT FACULTY

Sandra J. Anderson  
Elizabeth L. Anstaett  
Susan Azzyndar  
David Ball  
David S. Bloomfield  
Joseph M. Caliguri  
Hon. William B. Chandler  
Douglas Cole  
Hon. R. Guy Cole  
Matt Cooper  
Jonathan E. Coughlan  
James E. Davidson  
April Opper Davis  
Anita DiPasquale

Hon. Gregory Frost  
Todd G. Guttman  
Gail Block Harris  
Patricia Hatler  
Kimberly Weber Herlihy  
Hon. John E. Hoffman Jr.  
Barton Hubbard  
James Johnson  
Shawn Judge  
Hon. Terrence P. Kemp  
Hon. Norah McCann King  
Greg Kirstein  
Marya C. Kolman  
James K.L. Lawrence

Sherri B. Lazear  
Hon. Algenon Marbley  
Ingrid Mattson  
Hon. Stephen McIntosh  
Richard M. Mescher  
Robert J. Miller  
Samuel H. Porter  
Tanya J. Potect  
Ted L. Ramirez  
Frank A. Ray  
Douglas Rogers  
Dan D. Sandman  
Hon. Edmund A. Sargus  
Hon. Jennifer Sargus

Edward M. Segelken  
Elizabeth Sherowski  
Kimberly Shumate  
Scott V. Simpson  
Douglas Squires  
Hon. Jeffrey S. Sutton  
Mark R. Weaver  
Robert Weiler  
James Wilson  
Reid Wilson  
Stephanie Ziegler