“Have You a Favorite Hymn?”

BY TINA SCHNEIDER AND EMILY PRESTON

Introduction

Hymns can reflect a culture, a spiritual and musical language, and a theology. They can embody denominational perspective and musical traditions. Each hymnal is unique because of how, when, and by whom it was compiled, and most studies of hymnals focus on hymn texts or musical content. It is a rare case when a hymnal is put to a use not related to worship, and even rarer when one specific volume can lend insights into the views of world leaders. "Have You a Favorite Hymn?" Out of the over four thousand signatures these hymnals contain, a few stand out: Eleanor Roosevelt, Mary McLeod Bethune, Bayard Rustin, Jeannette Rankin, Herbert and Lou Henry Hoover, Reinhold Niebuhr, Paul Tillich, Samuel McCrea Cavert, and Billy Graham, among others.

Stanley Armstrong Hunter, a Presbyterian minister who pastored in Berkeley, California, in the early- to mid-twentieth century, provides us with a remarkable example of using hymnals for an historic hobby. During his extensive travels, he usually carried with him a hymnal, wherein he asked people he met to sign their names. According to his son Converse Hunter, when his father approached individuals for their autographs, his question to them was always, "Have you a favorite hymn?" He also compiled essays by several ministers in his organization is presented here to encourage further scholarly work. Hunter's hymnals are the work of a lifetime. Their signatures belonged to people of different political persuasions, races, denominations, and religions. Many of the people who signed them were not only important during their lifetimes, but left the world with lasting legacies in pacifism and social activism. There are no entries in these hymnals dated earlier than 1933 or later than 1959, the year that Hunter died. Hunter's hymnals deserve a closer examination to help understand the religious and social landscape of the mid-twentieth century as he experienced it. As part of an effort to make this hymnal accessible to researchers, we have created a database of the names of the people who signed it; its organization is presented here to encourage the launching of future hymnological endeavors.

Hunter's hymnals were donated to the Dictionary of North American Hymnology collection in 2011 by his daughter-in-law, Dorothea Hunter, after the death of her husband Converse. Of the five volumes donated by Dorothea Hunter, one stands out: the 1911 revision of the 1895 Presbyterian hymnal has by far the most signatures of any of the volumes and as such is the focal point of this article.

Dr. Stanley Armstrong Hunter

Stanley Armstrong Hunter was born August 23, 1888, in Ontario, Canada, to Rev. William Armstrong Hunter and his wife, Eliza. Stanley graduated from Princeton University in 1910 and then moved to Allahabad, India, where he taught at Allahabad Christian College until 1912. After returning to the United States, he graduated from Columbia University in 1914 with a Master of Arts, and then from Union Theological Seminary in 1916. In 1918, he married Elizabeth Pierce, and they had four children: Stanley Armstrong, William Armstrong III, Charlotte, and Converse. Stanley Armstrong and Charlotte did not survive to adulthood.

Hunter served as pastor of North Presbyterian Church in Pittsburgh from 1916 to 1924 and then as pastor of St. John's Presbyterian Church in Berkeley, California, from 1924 to 1954, when he retired. In 1925 he was given an honorary doctor of divinity from Occidental College. He also served as an interim pastor in Daly City, California, for three months in 1954, and again in 1955 at St. Paul's Presbyterian Church in San Francisco. Hunter died on December 31, 1959, at the age of seventy-one.

Hymns and church music were of special interest to Hunter, as were the religious lives of people he admired, as evidenced by his 1913 pamphlet The Religious Ideals of a President: Some Utterances of Woodrow Wilson Connected with the Religious Life. Notably, Wilson was the president of Princeton University when Hunter attended as an undergraduate student. At a speech Wilson gave to Princeton alumni in 1913, Hunter took advantage of the opportunity to present Wilson with a tiger tooth he had obtained during his time in India. The tooth was a gift for good luck, and Wilson put it with his collection of other gifts he had received. Hunter also wrote and compiled two works on religious music. He edited The Music of the Gospel, a compilation of essays on twenty-six hymns of various subjects, such as nature, youth, and discipleship. Hunter's contribution to the work was an essay on "Joyful, joyful, we adore Thee." He also compiled essays by several ministers in a book called Music and Religion, on the importance of music "in the conduct of worship and what ideas they might share regarding its bearing on religion."

---

1Held at the library on The Ohio State University's Lima Campus.


Pacifism and Ecumenism

Hunter was an ardent pacifist and advocate for interfaith relations. In the mid-1930s, leaders in the Buddhist faith, Judaism, and Protestant Christians united to form the Temple of Religion and Tower of Peace at the Golden Gate International Exposition in San Francisco in 1939. Hunter served on the board of directors, led by Rabbi Rudolph I. Coffee. This exposition was California’s World Fair on newly-built Treasure Island, designed to showcase the two new San Francisco Bay Bridges, and featured displays of art, architecture, food, and historic artifacts. Hunter’s own 1911 hymnal was on display. By that time, according to Hunter, nearly one thousand persons had signed the hymnal, including Eleanor Roosevelt.4 In an entry for her column “My Day,” Roosevelt remembers singing “Lead, kindly Light” with family on Sunday evenings.5

Several months before the Exposition was officially open to the public, a luncheon for one thousand people was held on Treasure Island. President Franklin D. Roosevelt gave a carefully worded speech to set the tone for the duration of the Golden Gate Exposition: “The year 1939 would go down in history not only as the year of the two great American Fairs, but would be a year of world-wide rejoicing if it could also mark definite steps toward permanent world peace. That is the hope and prayer of an overwhelming number of men and women and children in the world today.”6

During the Temple of Religion and Tower of Peace interfaith services, there was a special focus on peace. “Keep America Out of War” services were held every Sunday, starting on September 10; Hunter himself led the assembly of five thousand people that day in a prayer for peace. Hunter gave an address at the close of the fair on October 29, 1939, called “America – A Tower for Peace.”7 It is evident from Hunter’s involvement in the Temple of Religion and Tower of Peace exposition that he had connections to and communicated with individuals who actively worked for world peace.

Indeed, pacifism is a common theme of the signatures in the hymnal. Many of the notable individuals who signed it were active pacifists, such as Muriel Lester and Jeanette Rankin. Lester (1883-1968), who signed “Dear Lord and Father of mankind,” was one of the leading pacifists of her time, with particularly close ties to Gandhi. In 1931, Gandhi was a guest at Kingsley Hall, Lester’s community center in the East End of London, and Lester traveled multiple times to India.8 During her 1934


Autumn 2018 • Vol. 69, No. 4
lectured tour of the United States, Hunter arranged for Lester to come speak at his church; it was the first address that Lester gave in California, and she maintained strong ties to the Hunter family. Again, in 1937, Hunter arranged for Lester to give two talks, and Lester stayed with the Hunter and his wife at their home in Berkeley. Jeanette Rankin, the first woman to hold federal office in the United States when she was elected to Congress in 1916, signed the hymn “Lead, kindly Light.” Her pacifist views made her the object of criticism when she cast the only “no” vote to keep the United States out of World War II. “As a woman I can’t go to war, and I refuse to send anyone else,” she said about her choice. It is worth noting that “Lead, kindly Light” was one of the most popular hymns signed, with just over one hundred entries made on that hymn’s page alone. William Emilsen noted that this hymn was one of the most popular hymns in the English language by the end of the nineteenth century, in addition to being a hymn that “transcended not only denominational and cultural boundaries but also transcended religious boundaries to become a powerful influence upon Gandhi’s spirituality.”

After the Temple of Religion and Tower of Peace Exposition, Hunter continued to be involved in pacifism as well as ecumenical activism. Hunter involved herself in ecumenical work by attending an interdenominational youth conference at Lake Tahoe and often spoke to the young people there. The Presbyterian youth conferences at Lake Tahoe were “collaborative evangelical enterprises and harbors for ecumenical activity, operating across boundaries of presbytery, synod, and denomination.” Dates of the Lake Tahoe conference with signatures in the hymnal include the years of WWII and after.

The Hymnal Project

A hymnal such as Hunter’s is an historical treasure; it has the potential to reveal a tremendous amount of information about thousands of people. But how is this information best made available to researchers? Page scans, while intriguing, are not easy to decipher and at present are not conducive to OCR technology. Human effort was needed to distill the names from the hymnal to learn about the significance of the hymn in historical context. Because the list of names had to be coherent for future users, it required a structured approach to cataloging the information. The initial process of cataloging names required the use of an Excel spreadsheet. Each entry had six potential fields: Hymn Number, Hymn Chosen, First Name, Last Name, Date (if applicable), and any given Miscellaneous information. In addition, a special Notes field provided flexibility for adding information not in the hymnal itself, such as whether an entry needed further review, was the signature of a notable figure, or required any necessary clarifications.

Because people signed not only pages with hymns on them, but also the front and back matter of the hymnal, the Hymn Number field was used to signify which piece of front or back matter or page a person signed. While the Hymn Number field is useful to indicate where the signature is, but does not necessarily mean that it was the chosen hymn. Some hymns were so popular that the signatures for one hymn could cover more than one page. It was then necessary to signify that the page on which someone signed his or her name was not necessarily the hymn chosen, so the Hymn Chosen field was created to accurately reflect what the individual intended to sign. For instance, “Dear Lord and Father of mankind” or required any necessary clarifications.

The First Name field indicates the first name of the entry. While intriguing, are not easy to decipher and at present are not conducive to OCR technology. Letters that could be deciphered were entered in that field or required any necessary clarifications.

The First Name field indicates the first name of the entry. If there was no first name given, the field was left blank. If it was not decipherable, the word “unintelligible” was inserted. Letters that could be deciphered were entered in that field with an underscore to mark where there was doubt. A small number of entries had a couple who had signed their name jointly: e.g. “John and Jane Doe.” For the sake of keeping all data in the hymnal accurate, the two first names were entered as written into the First Name field. The Last Name field was created to indicate the last name of the entry, as well as any suffix data, such as Jr., II, MD, etc. As with the First Name

The database screen capture
field, information not given was left blank, undecipherable information was labeled "unintelligible," and letters that could be deciphered were indicated with an underscore and question mark for the rest.

The Date field, if applicable, was for entering the date on which the entry was written into the hymnal. For the sake of accuracy, the data was entered in the spreadsheet the way that it was written down in the hymnal. For instance, Muriel Lester wrote the date "17/12/1934," meaning December 17, 1934; several others used this style as well.

It is worthwhile to note that occasionally there were dates that could not be separated from the data to which they belonged. Therefore, some dates will be found in the Miscellaneous field. For instance, those who made their entries at Lake Tahoe and indicated so, often put the year that they attended. In addition, those who had served in the mission field would put the dates that they served; for example, Azalia Peet wrote, "Japan 1916-1940."

The Miscellaneous field contains all manner of information. Many individuals wrote down where they were from, the places they served as missionaries, or year they graduated from college, among many other personal pieces of information. The Miscellaneous field is also useful to have for the notes that Hunter himself made in the hymnal. In several places, he wrote down commentary on hymns, poetry (including a poem by Georgia Harkness), scripture verses, and other notes. All of what could be deciphered was inserted into the Miscellaneous field.

The last field, Notes, was created for the purpose of adding context to an entry or identifying a signature as a notable name. It was also used as a field to indicate where a complete entry was unintelligible, and to signal users where a name could have been misread and needs review.

The Names in the Hymnal: Theological Ties

By the time Hunter started collecting signatures in the early 1930s, the ecumenical movement was in full swing. The Federal Council of Churches (FCC), founded in 1908, was the first significant ecumenical event, bringing together Protestant Christians of various traditions. 14 At least two significant figures who were present at the FCC signed the hymnal, Samuel McCrea Cavert and John Foster Dulles, and both were influential in the future of the ecumenical movement. Cavert signed the hymnal twice: on May 19, 1936, he wrote his signature on "When I survey the wondrous cross," and at perhaps the same time put his signature on "Faith of our fathers." It is unclear whether he signed on separate occasions. Dulles, Secretary of State under President Eisenhower, signed the hymn "Through the night of doubt and sorrow," at the bottom of the page. Dulles had two things in common with Hunter: their fathers were Presbyterian ministers and Dulles was two years ahead of Hunter at Princeton University.

Anglican bishop and ecumenist Stephen Neill signed on hymn 82, "Holy, holy, holy." Neill authored and edited multiple works on the ecumenical movement and church history.

Two rabbis signed the hymnal, showing Hunter’s strong desire for interfaith relations. Rabbi Rudolph I. Coffee, with whom Hunter worked during the Temple of Religion exhibition, signed his name and "Ein Keloheinu" as his favorite hymn, one that appeared in both Jewish hymnals and Army and Navy hymnals of the time. 15 Rabbi William Stein signed his name on "O worship the King all glorious above," a text found in both Jewish and Christian hymnals. 16

Surprisingly, evangelist Billy Graham signed "Directions for Chanting." Hunter made a postscript date, May 8, 1958, next to Graham’s signature. This would have been during the time of Graham’s crusades in California, where Hunter would have had multiple opportunities to meet him. It is possible that Graham signed the hymnal in a

15 Union Hymnal (1897); The Sabbath School Hymnal (1904); The Army and Navy Hymnal (1921); New Jewish Hymnal for Religious Schools and Junior Congregations (1917). Hymnary.org, accessed Oct. 25, 2018.
hurry at one of these large gatherings.

Reinhold Niebuhr’s signature is found on “Ancient of Days.” It is unclear whether Niebuhr intended to sign “Ancient of Days” or the far more popular hymn “Holy, holy, holy,” on the facing page. Pure speculation might offer that he signed the page next to “Holy, holy, holy,” because it was convenient to do so. “Holy, holy, holy” was a popular hymn choice, and that page is full of entries.

D. Elton Trueblood, a Quaker academic and chaplain, signed “All people that on earth do dwell” and dated it November 26, 1936. In 1955, Lutheran theologian Paul Tillich signed the hymn “Our God, our help in ages past.” Pastor and author Harry Emerson Fosdick signed “Spirit of God, descend upon my heart.” Fosdick became a pacifist after the First World War. In a sermon that he gave for Armistice Day of 1933, he expresses his despair at the loss of life and his inner conflict over having served in the war. “I, too, was a gullible fool and thought that modern war could somehow make the world safe for democracy. They sent men like me to explain to the army the high meanings of war and, by every argument we could command, to strengthen their morale.” In the sermon, he recalls a moment in a dugout where a group of young soldiers sang “Lead, kindly Light.” One of Fosdick’s own texts, “God of grace and God of glory” was a popular choice for signatures as well.

Methodist theologian Georgia Harkness signed “Crown Him with many crowns.” Harkness was the first woman to teach theology in a seminary, and helped pave the way for women to become ordained in the Methodist church. In the back matter of the hymnal, Hunter wrote out a poem of hers, “The Glory of God.” The day after Hunter’s death, Harkness wrote a tribute to him, a copy of which is pasted into

one of the other hymnals donated by Dorothea Hunter. Harkness also wrote a poem about Lake Tahoe that Hunter inscribed into another of his hymnals.

Sam Higginbottom was a Presbyterian missionary, notable for founding the Allahabad Agricultural Institute in 1910, where Hunter taught for a brief time. During his time in India, Higginbottom became friends with Mahatma Gandhi. A letter that Gandhi wrote to Higginbottom was on display at the Temple of Religion exposition, along with Hunter’s 1911 hymnal. Higginbottom signed the hymnal on April 1, 1933, on the hymn “Jesus, lover of my soul.”

Politicians

Several politicians of various religious traditions also signed the hymnal. President Harry Truman is the very first name in the database, because he signed a page in the front matter of the hymnal. According to the Harry S. Truman Library and Museum, Truman was Baptist, though he was very private regarding his faith; his inscription is quite secular in nature: “Best wishes for a long and honorable life.”

Herbert Hoover signed the hymn “Our God, our help in ages past,” as well as “God of our fathers, known of old.” His wife, Lou Henry Hoover, signed underneath his name on “God of our fathers.” Hunter’s son Converse related the story about Herbert and Lou Hoover signing “Our God, our help: “According to Dad, Herbert Hoover couldn’t think of the words, being a Quaker, but called it the tune we ‘go out on.’”

Front matter, Truman

Hoovers

24 • THE HYMN
Ralph E. Flanders, US Senator from Vermont from 1946 to 1959, signed on hymn 89, "O God, the rock of ages."

Henry Wallace, the thirty-third vice president of the United States, signed on the popular Christmas hymn "Joy to the world." Henry Wallace's religious beliefs were diverse; raised a Presbyterian, Wallace left the denomination at a young age, and though he explored many different religions throughout his life, he eventually became an Episcopalian.

Peter Fraser, prime minister of New Zealand from 1940 until 1949, and one of the architects of the United Nations, signed "The Lord's my shepherd." He chaired the 1945 San Francisco Conference, where the first charter was signed by the 50 allied countries. It is likely that he signed the hymnal during his time there.

Nelson Rockefeller, grandson of John D. Rockefeller and forty-first vice president of the United States, signed the hymnal in the back matter and wrote the first line of his favorite hymn "March on my soul, with strength."

Social Activists

Mary McLeod Bethune, African American educator, civil rights activist, and advisor to Franklin Delano Roosevelt, signed the hymnal on May 7, 1945, on the hymn "How firm a foundation." In her papers, Bethune writes about her attendance at the United Nations Conference on International Organization in San Francisco. The Conference met from April 25 until June 26 of 1945. She was a consultant for the State Department on many issues, including "abolition of colonialism, the international bill of rights, and the inclusion of an adequate educational and cultural program into the Charter of the United Nations." It is possible that this was where she was when she signed the hymnal.

Though not a social activist, Muriel Lester's nephew, George A. Hogg, was a British journalist and explorer. In 1943, Hogg saved sixty Chinese orphan boys from Japanese soldiers by leading the boys on foot for seven hundred miles across China. He signed his name on hymn 190, "Brightest and best of the sons of the morning." After he passed away, Hunter went back and wrote "died in China" under Hogg's name, showing that Hunter took care to remember him.

"Dear Lord and Father of mankind" was a popular choice for other notable individuals, such as Bayard Rustin, Sherwood Eddy, and Michi Kawai. Bayard Rustin, an African American pacifist and civil rights leader, was posthumously awarded the Presidential Medal of Freedom. In 1911 Sherwood Eddy was the leading YMCA evangelist in India. After World War I, he became a pacifist and a socialist, spending over thirty years as the leader for Fellowship for a Christian Social Order. Michi Kawai was a Japanese Christian activist, author, and first Japanese National Secretary of the YWCA of Japan.

More People to Mention

There are many more notable people whose signatures are found in the hymnal, but there is room here for only a brief listing.

Olive J. Stamp was the wife of Josiah Charles Stamp, 1st Baron Stamp, GCB (Most Honourable Order of the Bath), GBE (Most Excellent Order of the British Empire). She, her husband, and oldest son were killed during the Blitz in April of 1941. She signed the hymn "O happy home, where thou art loved."

Wilfred Grenfell, a medical missionary to Newfoundland, signed the hymn "My God and Father," dated March of 1940, the year that he died. Several years before, in 1929, Sir and Lady Grenfell were fellow guests with Hunter and his wife at a tea hosted at a hotel in Oakland. The event was a forum for the Grenfells to give a talk on their travel experiences.

Physicist Arthur Compton made an entry on "Holy, holy, holy." Compton won the Nobel Prize for physics in 1927, and was once quoted saying "Science can have no quarrel with a religion which postulates a God to whom [men] are indebted for other notable individuals, such as Bayard Rustin, Sherwood Eddy, and Michi Kawai. Bayard Rustin, an African American pacifist and civil rights leader, was posthumously awarded the Presidential Medal of Freedom. In 1911 Sherwood Eddy was the leading YMCA evangelist in India. After World War I, he became a pacifist and a socialist, spending over thirty years as the leader for Fellowship for a Christian Social Order. Michi Kawai was a Japanese Christian activist, author, and first Japanese National Secretary of the YWCA of Japan.


His children." 31

Vida Dutton Scudder and her friend, Florence Converse, signed their names in the front matter of the hymnal, citing texts “Veni Sancte Spiritus” and “O quanta qualia” as their respective favorites. Vida Scudder was a socialist and, during World War II, aligned herself with the pacifist agenda. She was a professor at Wellesley College for forty years, along with Florence Converse. Scudder authored many books on Christianity and the social gospel. 32

Another notable figure was writer Alfred Noyes, the author of “The Highwayman.” He signed the hymnal twice: on “Sun of my soul, Thou Savior dear,” and “Lead, kindly Light.” It is unclear if he signed on separate occasions.

Two figures in the hymnological world signed their names in the hymnal. Calvin Laufer, hymnwriter, Presbyterian minister, and one of the founders of The Hymn Society in the United States and Canada, 33 made an entry on hymn 712, “I sought the Lord.” Laufer wrote and composed many texts and tunes, such as “We thank Thee, Lord thy paths of service lead” and “Thy work, O God, needs many hands.” 34

Homer Rodeheaver, a prolific hymnal editor, signed “All hail the power of Jesus’ name!” and instead of dating the signature, wrote a scripture verse: First Corinthians 14:15 “What is it then? I will pray with the spirit, and I will pray with the understanding also: I will sing with the spirit, and I will sing with the understanding also.” 35

Potential for Further Research

The database of names for the 1911 hymnal needs to be reviewed for possible corrections or additional deciphering of names, and the other hymnals donated by the Hunter family still need to be looked at as well. Nevertheless, this database is at present a tool that can launch or enhance historical research. It is a tremendous resource for those researching mid-twentieth century pacifism, social activism, missionary work, or ecumenism. It can shed light on the theological leanings of any number of notable figures, lending a brief look into a moment of personal reflection not available in any other source.

This database will be available online [Ed.: early in 2019 through thehymnsociety.org website]. Although Stanley Armstrong Hunter likely did not imagine his hobby would turn into a platform for academic research, using it for this purpose seems a fitting tribute to one who dedicated his life to the understanding of others. “Have you a favorite hymn?”


3 Corcoran, Theresa. Vida Dutton Scudder (Boston, MA: Twayne Publishers, 1982).


3 Cor 14:15 (King James Version).